

NETWORKED MINDS: OPINION DYNAMICS AND COLLECTIVE INTELLIGENCE IN SOCIAL NETWORKS

QUANTIFYING NETWORKS



Florence, the early 1400s.

Florence, the early 1400s. In the shadow of church bells and towers, patrician old-money families jostle for power with upstart, 'new men' merchant families.



Santa Maria del Fiore

Altered

Rosselli, F. (c. 1470-82). Pianta della Catena, aka Rosselli's *Chain Map*.

111

111





Amid this jostling, one family, the Medicis, rises to prominence.

Amid this jostling, one family, the Medicis, rises to prominence. Led by one man...

Cosimo de' Medici 1389 - 1464

Banker and politician.

Steers the Medicis to dominance in Florence, a position they go on to hold for three centuries to come.



Cosimo de' Medici 1389 - 1464

Banker and politician.

Steers the Medicis to dominance in Florence, a position they go on to hold for three centuries to come.

Political questions are settled in [Cosimo's] house. The man he chooses holds office... He is who decides peace and war... He is king in all but name.

Enea Silvio Piccolomini, Bishop of Siena, later Pope Pius II



MEDICI



Originally from the farmlands north of Florence, in Mugello.

Become wealthy through banking.

Cosimo seen as 'champion of the new men'.

Yet, it seems Cosimo was not an obvious leader.



JOHN F. PADGETT Cosimo was described by people who knew him as an indecipherable sphinx...



JOHN F. PADGETT Cosimo was described by people who knew him as an indecipherable sphinx...

...who exhibited an odd passivity.



JOHN F. PADGETT Cosimo was described by people who knew him as an indecipherable sphinx...

...who exhibited an odd passivity.

CHRISTOPHER K. ANSELL After passionate pleas by supplicants for action of some sort, Cosimo typically would terminate a meeting graciously but icily...



JOHN F. PADGETT



...who exhibited an odd passivity.

CHRISTOPHER K. ANSELL meeting graciously but icily...

- After passionate pleas by supplicants for action of some sort, Cosimo typically would terminate a
- ...with little more commitment than "Yes my son, I
- Padgett, J. F., & Ansell, C. K. (1993). Robust action and the rise of the Medici, 1400-1434. American Journal of Sociology, 98(6), 1259–1319.





shall look into that."

We have a puzzle on our hands.

We have a puzzle on our hands. If not his charisma, what *was* the secret to Cosimo's success?



JOHN F. PADGETT Cosimo was multiply embedded in complicated and sprawling Florentine marriage, economic, and patronage elite networks.



JOHN F. PADGETT

Cosimo was multiply embedded in complicated and sprawling Florentine marriage, economic, and patronage elite networks.

CHRISTOPHER K. ANSELL He engineered himself into a very important position in the network of early 15th century Florentine elites.



So what is a network?



We represent a social network as a graph G = (V, E), where V is the set of vertices (agents) and E is the set of edges (relationships).

MODEL

We represent a social network as a graph G = (V, E), where V is the set of vertices (agents) and E is the set of edges (relationships).

The graph can be *directed* or *undirected*, depending on whether relationships are one-way or two-way.





Like, who married who.

FLORENTINE FAMILIES GRAPH

A link represents a marriage between the two families.



FLORENTINE FAMILIES GRAPH

A link represents a marriage between the two families.

Considered as *strong* ties, in Granovetter's sense.



MEDICI



Originally from the farmlands north of Florence, in Mugello.

Become wealthy through banking.

Cosimo seen as 'champion of the new men'.



Old-money wool-merchant dynasty.

Maso, and then Rinaldo degli Albizzi basically were the Florentine state until Cosimo showed them the door in 1434.

ALBIZZI



Like, who married who.



Like, who married who.

Note that marriage ties are just one type of tie.

CHRISTOPHER K. ANSELL





Like, who married who.

CHRISTOPHER K. ANSELL Note that marriage ties are just one type of tie. The Medici had many other ties, e.g., business relationships.





Like, who married who.

CHRISTOPHER K. ANSELL

Note that marriage ties are just one type of tie.

The Medici had many other ties, e.g., business relationships.

Padgett, J. F., & Ansell, C. K. (1993). Robust action and the rise of the Medici, 1400-1434. American Journal of Sociology, 98(6), 1259–1319.



Check out out paper!

What do we want to keep track of with networks?

DEFINITION (NEIGHBORHOODS)

The neighborhood N(i) of a node *i* is the set of nodes that are directly connected to *i*:

$$N(i) = \{ j \in V \mid (i, j) \in E \}.$$

FLORENTINE FAMILIES GRAPH Neighborhoods

The neighborhood of the Medici consists of the Salviati, Acciaiuoli, Barbadori, Ridolfi, Tornabuoni and Albizzi.





DEFINITION (DEGREE)

The degree d_i of a node i is the size of i's neighborhood:

$$d_i = |N(i)|,$$

i.e., the number of nodes directly connected to *i*.

FLORENTINE FAMILIES GRAPH Degrees

Highest degrees: the Medicis (6), the Guadagnis (4), the Strozzis (4).


DEFINITION (DEGREE DISTRIBUTION)

The degree distribution P(d) of a network is a description of the relative frequencies of nodes that have different degrees.

In other words, P(d) is the fraction of nodes that have degree d.

DEFINITION (DEGREE DISTRIBUTION)

The degree distribution P(d) of a network is a description of the relative frequencies of nodes that have different degrees.

In other words, P(d) is the fraction of nodes that have degree d.

The function P can be a frequency distribution, if we are describing a specific network;

DEFINITION (DEGREE DISTRIBUTION)

The degree distribution P(d) of a network is a description of the relative frequencies of nodes that have different degrees.

In other words, P(d) is the fraction of nodes that have degree d.

The function P can be a frequency distribution, if we are describing a specific network; or a probability distribution, if we are working with random networks.



FLORENTINE FAMILIES GRAPH Degree distribution

Degree	Family	6	
6	Medici	5	
5	_	4	
4	Guadagni, Strozzi	requency w	
3	Tornabuoni, Ridolfi, Albizzi, Bischeri, Peruzzi, Castellani	2	
2	Salviati, Barbadori	1	
1	Pazzi, Ginori, Lamberteschi, Acciaiuoli		
		0	1



Degree Distribution of Florentine Families Graph

What kind of degree distributions are there?

What kind of degree distributions are there? Depends on the type of graph.

What kind of degree distributions are there? Depends on the type of graph. Here's one popular model.

DEFINITION (ERDŐS–RÉNYI MODEL)

For a set of n nodes and a probability p, the Erdős-Rényi model generates a random graph G(n, p) by going through all possible pairs of nodes and adding an edge between them with probability p.

G(n,p) **EXAMPLE**



n = 30, p = 0.05

1

*Node labels are the degrees.



0



G(n,p) **EXAMPLE**

n = 30, p = 0.25

*Node labels are the degrees.



G(n,p) **EXAMPLE**

n = 30, p = 0.7

*Node labels are the degrees.



What does the degree distribution for random graphs look like?

G(n,p)Degree distribution

The degree distribution of an Erdős-Rényi random graph G(n, p) is given by the binomial distribution:

$$\Pr\left[d=k\right] = \binom{n-1}{k} p^k (1-p)^{n-1-k}.$$

G(n,p)Degree distribution

The degree distribution of an Erdős-Rényi random graph G(n, p) is given by the binomial distribution:

$$\Pr\left[d=k\right] = \binom{n-1}{k} p^k (1-p)^{n-1-k}$$

The 'typical' node has degree (n-1)p.





G(n,p)Degree distribution

The degree distribution of an Erdős-Rényi random graph G(n, p) is given by the binomial distribution:

$$\Pr\left[d=k\right] = \binom{n-1}{k} p^k (1-p)^{n-1-k}$$

The 'typical' node has degree (n-1)p.



Degree Distribution of G(n, p) graph

Unfortunately, many real world social networks do not look like random graphs.

ACTOR COLLABORATION GRAPH

Actors are connected if they acted together in a movie.





ACTOR COLLABORATION GRAPH Degree distribution

Many nodes of low degree, some of middling degree, a couple with high degree.



Rossi, R. A., & Ahmed, N. K. (n.d.). <u>ca-IMDB. Network Data Repository</u>. Retrieved May 31, 2025.

ACTOR COLLABORATION GRAPH Degree distribution

Many nodes of low degree, some of middling degree, a couple with high degree.

No 'typical' node.



Rossi, R. A., & Ahmed, N. K. (n.d.). <u>ca-IMDB. Network Data Repository</u>. Retrieved May 31, 2025.

DEFINITION (SCALE FREE NETWORK)

A scale-free network is a type of network whose degree distribution follows a power law:

$$P(d) \sim c \cdot d^{-\gamma},$$

where c > 0 and γ is a constant typically in the range $2 < \gamma < 3$.

SCALE FREE NETWORKS

The relative frequencies stay constant as the degree grows from d to kd:

$$\frac{P(kd)}{P(d)} = \frac{c \cdot k^{-\gamma} d^{-\gamma}}{c \cdot d^{-\gamma}}$$
$$= k^{-\gamma}.$$

SCALE FREE NETWORKS

The relative frequencies stay constant as the degree grows from d to kd:

$$\frac{P(kd)}{P(d)} = \frac{c \cdot k^{-\gamma} d^{-\gamma}}{c \cdot d^{-\gamma}}$$
$$= k^{-\gamma}.$$

This is true regardless of the degree *d* we start with:

$$\frac{P(2)}{P(1)} = \frac{P(20)}{P(10)} = \frac{P(200)}{P(100)} = \dots$$

SCALE FREE NETWORKS

The relative frequencies stay constant as the degree grows from d to kd:

$$\frac{P(kd)}{P(d)} = \frac{c \cdot k^{-\gamma} d^{-\gamma}}{c \cdot d^{-\gamma}}$$
$$= k^{-\gamma}.$$

This is true regardless of the degree d we start with:

•

$$\frac{P(2)}{P(1)} = \frac{P(20)}{P(10)} = \frac{P(200)}{P(100)} = \dots$$

Best seen when graphing the degree distribution...

1.0 0.8 0.6 $1/d^{\gamma}$ 0.4 0.2 0.0



SCALE FREE NETWORKS Intuition

The relative frequencies stay constant as the degree grows from d to kd:

$$\frac{P(kd)}{P(d)} = \frac{c \cdot k^{-\gamma} d^{-\gamma}}{c \cdot d^{-\gamma}}$$
$$= k^{-\gamma}.$$

This is true regardless of the degree d we start with:

$$\frac{P(2)}{P(1)} = \frac{P(20)}{P(10)} = \frac{P(200)}{P(100)} = \dots$$

Best seen when graphing the degree distribution...

... on a *log-log scale*, for readability: the degree distribution of a scale-free network appears as a straight line with slope $-\gamma$.

 10^{-4}

1/d^v (log scale)



How can we generate scale-free networks?

DEFINITION (BARABÁSI–ALBERT MODEL)

Start with m_0 nodes. New nodes are added, one at a time. Each new node connects to an existing node *i* with a probability p_i proportional to *i*'s degree:

$$p_i = \frac{d_i}{\sum_j d_j}$$

In this process, nodes that are already well-connected get more connections.



In this process, nodes that are already well-connected get more connections.



In this process, nodes that are already well-connected get more connections.



In this process, nodes that are already well-connected get more connections.

A richer-get-richer type of effect.

Leads to the emergence of hubs.



In this process, nodes that are already well-connected get more connections.



In this process, nodes that are already well-connected get more connections.



In this process, nodes that are already well-connected get more connections.



In this process, nodes that are already well-connected get more connections.

A richer-get-richer type of effect.

Leads to the emergence of hubs.



BARABÁSI–ALBERT MODEL Degree distribution

We see the expected pattern in the degree distribution.





Degree Distribution of Barabási - Albert graph
Another thing we want to look at are the distances between the nodes.

DEFINITION (DISTANCE BETWEEN NODES)

The distance d(i, j) between two nodes i and j in a network is the length of the shortest path between *i* and *j*.











DEFINITION (DIAMETER)

The *diameter* of a network *G* is the maximum distance between any two nodes:

$$\mathsf{diam}(G) = \max_{i,j \in V} d(i,j).$$

PATHS AND STARS AND TREES Diameters



DEFINITION (AVERAGE SHORTEST PATH LENGTH)

The average shortest path length L(G) of a network G is the average distance between all pairs of nodes:

$$L(G) = \frac{1}{|V|(|V|-1)} \sum_{i,j \in V} d(i,j).$$

PATHS AND STARS AND TREES Average shortest path lengths

 $L(G_{
m tree})=2.28$

d(4,6)=4 $d(i,j)=1, ext{for any } i,j$ $diam(G_{tree}) = 4$ $diam(G_{complete}) = 1$ $L(G_{ ext{complete}}) = 1$

FLORENTINE FAMILIES GRAPH Diameter & average shortest path length

If the graph was a line with 15 elements, the diameter would be 14 and the average shortest path length would be 5.3.

 $L(G_{
m Florentine \ Families})=2.49$

Another important factor is the clustering, i.e., how close a graph is to being a clique.

DEFINITION (CLUSTERING COEFFICIENT OF INDIVIDUAL NODES) The clustering coefficient Cl(i) of a node i is the fraction of pairs of its neighbors

connected to each other:

 $Cl(i) = \frac{\text{number of edges between neighbors of } i}{\text{number of pairs of neighbors of } i} = \frac{\left| \left\{ \{j,k\} \subseteq N(i) \mid (j,k) \in E \right\} \right|}{\left| \left\{ \{j,k\} \subseteq N(i) \right\} \right|}$

DEFINITION (CLUSTERING COEFFICIENT OF INDIVIDUAL NODES) The *clustering coefficient* Cl(i) of a node *i* is the fraction of pairs of its neighbors

The clustering coefficient Cl(i) of a node i is the fraction connected to each other:

$$Cl(i) = {number of edges between neighbors of i \over number of pairs of neighbors of i}$$

$$= \frac{\left|\left\{\{j,k\} \subseteq N(i) \mid (j,k) \in E\right\}\right|}{\binom{d_i}{2}}$$

 $= \frac{\left|\left\{\{j,k\} \subseteq N(i) \mid (j,k) \in E\right\}\right|}{\left|\left\{\{j,k\} \subseteq N(i)\right\}\right|}$

DEFINITION (CLUSTERING COEFFICIENT OF INDIVIDUAL NODES) The *clustering coefficient* Cl(i) of a node *i* is the fraction of pairs of its neighbors

The clustering coefficient Cl(i) of a node i is the fraction connected to each other:

$$Cl(i) = \frac{\text{number of edges between neighbors of } i}{\text{number of pairs of neighbors of } i} = \frac{\left|\left\{\{j,k\} \subseteq N(i) \mid (j,k) \in E\right\}\right|}{\binom{d_i}{2}}$$
$$= 2 \cdot \frac{\left|\left\{\{j,k\} \subseteq N(i) \mid (j,k) \in E\right\}\right|}{d_i(d_i-1)}.$$

 $\frac{\left|\left\{\{j,k\}\subseteq N(i)\mid (j,k)\in E\right\}\right|}{\left|\left\{\{j,k\}\subseteq N(i)\right\}\right|}$

FLORENTINE FAMILIES GRAPH Clustering coefficients of nodes

The Strozzi have six pairs of neighbors, two of which are connected.

Their clustering coefficient is thus $\frac{1}{3}$.

MEDICI

Originally from the farmlands north of Florence, in Mugello.

Become wealthy through banking.

Cosimo seen as 'champion of the new men'.

Old-money wool-merchant dynasty.

Maso, and then Rinaldo degli Albizzi basically *were* the Florentine state until Cosimo showed them the door in 1434.

STROZZI

Biggest balance-sheet in Florence until 1434.

Bankers, art patrons, ringleaders of one-year exile for Cosimo.

Line goes on, with living descendants to this day.

NATALIA GUICCIARDINI STROZZI The Strozzi's were enemies of the Medici family.

The Medici's kept us in exile, and throughout the Renaissance the two clans were constantly involved in a power struggle.

Yet today we have portraits of the Medici in our house.

As a reminder that we're still here and they're not...

<u>An interview with Natalia Guicciardini Strozzi</u>. (2007, May 16). The Florentine.

DEFINITION (CLUSTERING COEFFICIENT OF NETWORK) The *clustering coefficient* Cl(G) of network G is the average clustering coefficient of its nodes:

$$Cl(G) = \frac{1}{|V|} \sum_{i \in V} Cl(i).$$

Note that the clustering coefficient is a number between 0 and 1.

PATHS AND STARS AND TREES Average clustering

FLORENTINE FAMILIES GRAPH Clustering coefficient

Average clustering for Florentine families.

 $Cl(G_{\text{Florentine-Families}}) = 0.16$

An important class of networks are *small-world* networks.

DEFINITION (SMALL WORLD NETWORK)

A small-world network is a type of network characterized by a high clustering coefficient and short average path length:

 $L(G) \sim \log(|V|),$

i.e., the average distance between any two nodes is proportional to the logarithm of the number of nodes.

The idea of a small world network also underlies things like the six degrees of separation factoid.

PAUL ERDŐS And the Erdős number!

ERDOS PAUL

RODU VOITECHAR

HARARY, FRANK

Dan, G. (2014). <u>No. 111: Visualizing Erdos Collaborators</u>. Retrieved June 16, 2025.

ODLYZKO ANDREW M

DEFINITION (WATTS-STROGATZ MODEL)

Start with a graph where each node is connected to exactly k other nodes. Then, at every time step, randomly rewire each edge with probability p to an unattached node.

DUNCAN WATTS When we looked at real world networks, we saw that they had two characteristics: high clustering, and low average path length.

DUNCAN WATTS When we looked at real world networks, we saw that they had two characteristics: high clustering, and low average path length.

They were small-world networks!

DUNCAN WATTS When we looked at real world networks, we saw that they had two characteristics: high clustering, and low average path length.

They were small-world networks!

STEVEN STROGATZ Random networks don't fit the bill.



DUNCAN WATTS When we looked at real world networks, we saw that they had two characteristics: high clustering, and low average path length.

They were small-world networks!

STEVEN STROGATZ Random networks don't fit the bill.

They have short average path length, but *low* clustering!





DUNCAN WATTS When we looked at real world networks, we saw that they had two characteristics: high clustering, and low average path length.

They were small-world networks!

STEVEN STROGATZ Random networks don't fit the bill.

They have short average path length, but *low* clustering!



DUNCAN WATTS Our model tries to fix that.

Watts, D. J., & Strogatz, S. H. (1998). Collective dynamics of "small-world" networks. *Nature*, 393(6684), 440–442.



Ok, but we're no closer to figuring out what made Cosimo so effective.